

## **The Honorable James L. Robart**

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
AT SEATTLE

NINA VARGHIS, individual,

Plaintiff,

NO. 2:19-CV-1136-JLR

VS.

## STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

APPLE INC., a California corporation,

Defendant.

## 1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with LCR 26(c). It does not confer blanket protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles, and it does not presumptively entitle parties to file confidential information under seal.

## 2. "CONFIDENTIAL" MATERIAL

“Confidential” material shall include, but will not be limited to, the following documents and tangible things produced or otherwise exchanged: medical records of Plaintiff Nina Varghis;

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER -  
NO. 2:19-CV-1136-JLR

- 1 -

Betts  
Patterson  
Mines  
**One Convention Place**  
Suite 1400  
701 Pike Street  
Seattle, Washington 98101-3927  
(206) 292-9988

1 documents related to product design and technical specifications; documents related to product  
 2 testing; documents related to product registration or technical standards; documents containing  
 3 customer information or other personally identifiable information (including that of Plaintiff  
 4 Nina Varghis); documents related to pricing of products or component parts; documents that  
 5 reveal proprietary internal processes or procedures; and other documents reasonably determined  
 6 to contain non-public, commercially sensitive information or data.

7 3. SCOPE

8 The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only confidential material (as  
 9 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential material; (2)  
 10 all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony,  
 11 conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material.

12 However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in  
 13 the public domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise.

14 4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL

15 4.1 Basic Principles. A receiving party may use confidential material that is disclosed  
 16 or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,  
 17 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be disclosed only to  
 18 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Confidential  
 19 material must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner  
 20 that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

21 4.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise  
 22 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may  
 23 disclose any confidential material only to:

24 (a) the receiving party’s counsel of record in this action, as well as employees  
 25 of counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER -  
NO. 2:19-CV-1136-JLR

- 2 -

Betts  
 Patterson  
 Mines  
 One Convention Place  
 Suite 1400  
 701 Pike Street  
 Seattle, Washington 98101-3927  
 (206) 292-9988

(b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in house counsel) of the receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the parties agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney's Eyes Only and is so designated;

(c) experts and consultants to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(d) the court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;

(e) copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the duplication of confidential material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or imaging service instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and to immediately return all originals and copies of any confidential material;

(f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the designating party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal confidential material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this agreement;

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

4.3 Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing or referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party, in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will remove the confidential designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a motion to seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process, the

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER -  
NO. 2:19-CV-1136-JLR

- 3 -

**Betts  
Patterson  
Mines**  
**One Convention Place**  
Suite 1400  
701 Pike Street  
Seattle, Washington 98101-3927  
(206) 292-9988

1 designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at issue,  
 2 and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to  
 3 sealing the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be  
 4 followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to  
 5 file material under seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information  
 6 must satisfy the requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the  
 7 motion to seal. Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied,  
 8 in accordance with the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.

9 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

10 **5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.** Each party  
 11 or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take  
 12 care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate  
 13 standards. The designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material,  
 14 documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the  
 15 material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not  
 16 swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this agreement.

17 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are  
 18 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to  
 19 unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary  
 20 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

21 If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated  
 22 for protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other  
 23 parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

24 **5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations.** Except as otherwise provided in this  
 25 agreement (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER -  
 NO. 2:19-CV-1136-JLR

- 4 -

Betts  
 Patterson  
 Mines  
**One Convention Place**  
 Suite 1400  
 701 Pike Street  
 Seattle, Washington 98101-3927  
 (206) 292-9988

1 ordered, disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must  
2 be clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

3 (a) Information in documentary form: (e.g., paper or electronic documents  
4 and deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial  
5 proceedings), the designating party must affix the word “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that  
6 contains confidential material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for  
7 protection, the producing party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by  
8 making appropriate markings in the margins).

9 (b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties  
10 and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the deposition or other  
11 pretrial proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other  
12 testimony after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within fifteen days after  
13 receiving the transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the  
14 transcript, or exhibits thereto, as confidential. If a party or non-party desires to protect  
15 confidential information at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.

16 (c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place  
17 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word  
18 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection,  
19 the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

20 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to  
21 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party’s  
22 right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a  
23 designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is  
24 treated in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

25  
STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER -  
NO. 2:19-CV-1136-JLR

- 5 -

Betts  
Patterson  
Mines  
**One Convention Place**  
Suite 1400  
701 Pike Street  
Seattle, Washington 98101-3927  
(206) 292-9988

1       6. **CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

2       6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of  
 3 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party's confidentiality  
 4 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic  
 5 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to  
 6 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the  
 7 original designation is disclosed.

8       6.2 Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute  
 9 regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding  
 10 confidential designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in  
 11 a declaration or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer  
 12 conference with other affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The  
 13 certification must list the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to  
 14 confer requires a face-to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

15       6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court  
 16 intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under  
 17 Local Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of  
 18 persuasion in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those  
 19 made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on  
 20 other parties) may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to  
 21 maintain the material in question as confidential until the court rules on the challenge.

1 7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER  
 2 LITIGATION

3 If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels  
 4 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that  
 5 party must:

6 (a) promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the  
 7 subpoena or court order;

8 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to  
 9 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is  
 10 subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this agreement; and

11 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued  
 12 by the designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

13 8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

14 If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential  
 15 material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving  
 16 party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized  
 17 disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material,  
 18 (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of  
 19 this agreement, and (d) request that such person or persons execute the "Acknowledgment and  
 20 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

21 9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED  
 22 MATERIAL

23 When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently  
 24 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the  
 25 receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This

1 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery  
2 order or agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree  
3 to the entry of a non-waiver order under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) as set forth herein.

4 **10. NON TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS**

5 Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving  
6 party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts  
7 and summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate methods of  
8 destruction.

9 Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all  
10 documents filed with the court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence,  
11 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert  
12 work product, even if such materials contain confidential material.

13 The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a  
14 designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

15  
16 ///

17  
18 ///

19  
20 ///

21  
22 ///

23  
24 ///

25  
STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER -  
NO. 2:19-CV-1136-JLR

- 8 -

Betts  
Patterson  
Mines  
**One Convention Place**  
Suite 1400  
701 Pike Street  
Seattle, Washington 98101-3927  
(206) 292-9988

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

DATED this 7<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2020.

LOPEZ & FANTEL, INC. P.S.

BETTS, PATTERSON & MINES, P.S.

By s/ Carl A. Taylor Lopez  
Carl A. Taylor Lopez, WSBA #6215  
Lopez & Fantel, Inc. P.S.  
2292 W. Commodore Way, Suite 200  
Seattle, WA 98199  
Telephone: (206) 322-5200  
E-mail: [clopez@lopezfantel.com](mailto:clopez@lopezfantel.com)  
Attorney for Plaintiff

By /s Christopher W. Tompkins  
By /s Natasha A. Khachatourians  
Christopher W. Tompkins, WSBA #11686  
Natasha A. Khachatourians, WSBA #42685  
Betts, Patterson & Mines, P.S.  
One Convention Place, Suite 1400  
701 Pike Street  
Seattle WA 98101-3927  
Telephone: (206) 292-9988  
E-mail: [ctompkins@bpmlaw.com](mailto:ctompkins@bpmlaw.com)  
E-mail: [nkhachatourians@bpmlaw.com](mailto:nkhachatourians@bpmlaw.com)  
Attorneys for Defendant Apple Inc.

## SCHIFF HARDIN LLP

By /s/ Steven E. Swaney  
Steven E. Swaney, CA Bar #221437  
*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*  
Schiff Hardin LLP  
4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1350  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 901-8700  
E-mail: [sswaney@schiffhardin.com](mailto:sswaney@schiffhardin.com)  
Attorney for Defendant Apple Inc.

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER -  
NO. 2:19-CV-1136-JLR

- 9 -

**Betts  
Patterson  
Mines**  
**One Convention Place**  
Suite 1400  
701 Pike Street  
Seattle, Washington 98101-3927  
(206) 292-9988

1 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED  
2  
3

4 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any  
5 documents in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal  
6 or state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to  
7 those documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or  
8 any other privilege or protection recognized by law.

9  
10 DATED: May 7, 2020

11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

---

James L. Robart  
United States District Court Judge

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER -  
NO. 2:19-CV-1136-JLR

- 10 -

Betts  
Patterson  
Mines  
**One Convention Place**  
Suite 1400  
701 Pike Street  
Seattle, Washington 98101-3927  
(206) 292-9988

**EXHIBIT A**

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on \_\_\_\_\_ in the case of *Nina Varghis v. Apple Inc.*, Case No. 2:19-cv-01136-JLR. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed:

Printed name:

Signature:

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER -  
NO. 2:19-CV-1136-JLR

- 11 -

**Betts  
Patterson  
Mines**  
**One Convention Place**  
Suite 1400  
701 Pike Street  
Seattle, Washington 98101-3927  
(206) 292-9988